

P.O. Box 5675, Berkeley, CA 94705 USA

ENDING THE SALE OF CHILDREN FOR THE PURPOSE OF FORCED LABOUR

Contact Information:

Katie Hall, Frank C. Newman Intern Kjhall2@usfca.edu

Representing Human Rights Advocates through University of San Francisco School of Law's International Human Rights Clinic Tel: 415-422-6961 Professor Connie de la Vega delavega@usfca.edu

I. INTRODUCTION

The Convention on the Rights of the Child, the subsequent Optional Protocol and creation of the Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography were instrumental steps in addressing the global needs of children. In an effort to further protect the rights of the child the United Nations Commission on Human Rights also appointed a Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography in 1990. The mandate contains five purposes: (1) analyze the root causes of the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, (2) identify contributing factors and new patterns, (3) promote best practices and strategies to prevent the sale and sexual exploitation of children, (4) make recommendations on the promotion and protection of the rights of children who are actual or potential victims, and (5) rehabilitate child victims of sale or sexual exploitation.

The Special Rapporteur has worked to champion the need to protect children, however by their own admission the work of the mandate has mainly focused on the sexual exploitation of children and little has been done regarding the sale of children.³ Even the implementation of the Optional Protocol to the Convention of the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography has thus far mainly been addressed from the angle of the sexual exploitation of children.⁴ Luckily, there has been a raising global awareness of the need to address the sale of children, especially children sold for the purposes of forced labour.

In August 2016 the Special Rapporteur prepared a report about the sale of children for forced labour where they highlighted several key issues that allow the practice to continue, including a lack of understanding of the scope of the problem and gaps and loopholes in the

⁴ Id.

¹ UN Commission on Human Rights Resolution. 1990/68

² HRC mandate resolution 7/13

³ Report of the Special Rapporteur of the Human Rights Council on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, pg. 6, A/71/261.

current global framework.⁵ This report by Human Rights Advocates strives to reinforce the findings of the Special Rapporteur's August 2016 report, to continue to draw attention to the issue of the sale of children for forced labour and to urge the United Nations Human Rights Council to help close the gaps in the international framework that allow children to be exploited for labour.

II. NEED FOR A DEFINITION

One reason the sale of children for forced labour has not been clearly addressed is that there is no unifying definition of what is considered selling a child or what work encompasses forced labour for a child. There are various international frameworks that address the sale of children and while they all speak to the general issue of selling a child for forced labour, their lack of detail and overall general nature has allowed for gaps in what is covered in both the national and international framework, enabling the continued perpetration of the crime.

Article 32 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child prohibits any work that could impair a child's development,⁶ and Article 35 forbids the sale of children for any purpose.⁷ The Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography states in Article 2 the "sale of children means any act or transaction whereby a child is transferred by any person or group of persons to another for remuneration or any other consideration." And Article 3 of the Optional Protocol obliges states to criminalize the action of "offering, delivering or accepting, by whatever means, a child for the purpose of engagement of the child in forced labour." This Convention and Optional Protocol

⁵ Id.

⁶ UN General Assembly, *Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 20 November 1989, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1577, p. 3, available at: http://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b38f0.html [accessed 22 February 2017]

⁸ UN General Assembly, *Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography*, 16 March 2001, A/RES/54/263, available at: http://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b38bc.html [accessed 22 February 2017]

⁹ Id.

appear to lay out what it entails to sell a child, but they do not address the definition of "labour" or "employment" for children leaving gaps for allowing the practice to continue.

The International Labour Organization (ILO) has addressed the issue of child labour extensively and has concluded that not all work done by children should be classified as child labour that should be prohibited. The ILO finds the term "child labour" is often defined as work that deprives children of their childhood, their potential and their dignity, and that it is harmful to physical and mental development. ¹⁰ It refers to work that:

- is mentally, physically, socially or morally dangerous and harmful to children; and
- interferes with their schooling by:
 - (1) depriving them of the opportunity to attend school, (2) obliging them to leave school prematurely; or (3) requiring them to attempt to combine school attendance with excessively long and heavy work.¹¹

In its most extreme forms, child labour involves children being enslaved, separated from their families, exposed to serious hazards and illnesses and/or left to fend for themselves on the streets of large cities – often at a very early age. Whether or not particular forms of "work" can be called "child labour" depends on the child's age, the type and hours of work performed, the conditions under which it is performed and the objectives pursued by individual countries. The answer varies from country to country, as well as among sectors within countries. ¹²

While child trafficking is similar in many ways to sale of children for the purpose of forced labour there are differences that are not covered by international agreements that address trafficking. As a general rule, the key characteristic in trafficking is the transfer of the child for

¹² Id.

¹⁰ International Labour Organization, What is child labour, http://www.ilo.org/ipec/facts/lang--en/index.htm [accessed on February 10, 2017].

^{..} Id

the purpose of exploitation which may or may not involve a sale.¹³ Sale does not necessarily imply transportation, but does involve a transfer of control of authority, leading to an overlap with trafficking.¹⁴ Yet some forms of sale of children for this purpose do not amount to trafficking, even if they have a similar effect. An example could be the sale of a child for domestic work or a servile marriage following a transaction with the child's family. These children are indeed being sold for work, but it could take place in the same town meaning the child was not transported or trafficked any distance. This example highlights that the trafficking laws cannot be relied upon to criminalize sale of children for forced labour.

All of these frameworks present pieces of what is necessary to end the sale of children for forced labour, however, due to loopholes the practice has continued. Without a clear definition that actually elaborates and provides for a clear definition of what sale of children for forced labour encompasses, it is challenging for nations to pass laws effectively protecting the rights of children and for the issue of the sale of children for forced labour to be highlighted in the global framework.

III. PREVALENCE OF THE PROBLEM

One of the issues in ending the practice of selling children for forced labour is that there are no reliable estimates of the number of child victims of the sale for the purpose of forced labour. This is a result of several factors including the hidden nature of the phenomenon, and the lack of focus on the crime by law enforcement. Additionally there is confusion in how to track the forced sale of children for child labour as the practice overlaps with various other issues, such

¹³ UNICEF Innocenti Research Center, "Handbook on the Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography," pg. 4, (Florence, 2009).

¹⁴ See Report, supra at note 3, pg. 8.

¹⁵ Id. at 9.

¹⁶ Id.

as trafficking, forced labour, and child labour. Perpetrators of the crime have exploited this to operate in ways not currently banned by the existing legal frameworks.

As the sale of children for forced labour is not a category that has traditionally been tracked, ¹⁷ it is necessary to use approximations from other data to see an estimated scope of the problem. In the most recent global estimate there are currently 26.9 million persons working in forced labour, 5.5 million of them children, with women and girls representing 55 percent of the total at 11.4 million. ¹⁸ The most recent estimates for the number of people trafficked each year indicate that there is an increase in the percentage of people being trafficked for forced labour. From the 2010-2012 reporting period, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) identified 31,766 victims of trafficking. ¹⁹ This number was self-reported by 80 countries who participated in a survey of information and usually only includes victims that have had contact with law enforcement or with shelters in each respective country. Thus it is possible this number is drastically lower than the actual amount of trafficking victims in each country, and does not include nations that did not participate in the survey. ²⁰

The majority of trafficking victims are subjected to sexual exploitation, but the number of victims trafficked for forced labour increased from 32% in 2007 to 40% in 2011, the most recent year for which data is available. An increase in children being trafficked for armed combat, or for petty crime and forced begging, a possible form of forced labour, has also been detected. It should also be noted that trafficking for forced labour is also much more common in East Asia

¹¹

¹⁷ The more prevalent issues of children trafficked for sexual exploitation, or the number of individuals as a whole working in forced labour or even just child labour have been tracked by various governments, NGOs, and UN agencies, however children sold for forced labour has yet to be a specific category that is calculated. *See* the U.S. Department of Labour, Bureau of International Labour Affairs List of Good Produced by Child Labor or Forced Labor, September 2016 as an example of statistics that are similar, but not exactly tracking this issue.

¹⁸ ILO, "Global estimate of forced labour; results and methodology," pg. 14, (Geneva 2012)

¹⁹ UNODC, "Global report on trafficking in persons, 2014," pg. 29 (Vienna, 2014).

²⁰ Id

²¹ UNODC, "Global report on trafficking in persons, 2014," pg. 9 (Vienna, 2014).

²² Id.

and the South Pacific. Most recent estimates show that 64% of all trafficking in the region is for forced labour.²³ In comparison trafficking for forced labour accounts for 37% of all trafficking in Africa and the middle east, 47% in the Americas, and 26% in Europe and Central Asia.²⁴ Most notably of all the trafficked persons, the share of children being trafficked has also been increasing. Globally, children now comprise nearly one third of all detected trafficking victims, with girls being trafficked at twice the rate as boys.²⁵ This is a 5% increase compared to the 2007-2010 reporting period.²⁶

While these two sets of statistics, forced labour and trafficking, do not specifically identify the number of children being sold for forced labour, it is helpful to demonstrate that the there are millions of children in forced labour around the world, and that trafficking in children is only increasing. By using these statistics it is possible to draw an inference of the extent of the phenomenon and the major trends, mainly that the number of children in forced labour is increasing. This was also highlighted in the Special Rapporteur's 2016 report.²⁷

III. TYPES OF FORCED LABOUR CHILDREN ARE SOLD INTO

Children are sold and compelled to engage in forced labour in a wide variety of sectors and occupations. While some situations are easily identifiable as falling under the category of sale of children for forced labour, other situations amount to the same crime but may not be readily identified.²⁸ This difficulty in identifying forced labour in the context of children highlights one of the reasons why there are not accurate estimates for the number of children sold for forced labour.

²³ Id.

²⁴ Id.

²⁵ Id. at 11.

²⁶ Id. at 5

²⁷ See Report, supra at 3, pg. 9

²⁸ Id.

The following are some examples of the most common types of forced labour children are sold into.

A. Domestic Work

The sale of children for the purpose of forced labour in domestic work is a widespread phenomenon.²⁹ Domestic work can amount to a form of forced labour depending on the relationship between the child and the employer. If the child is heavily dependent on their employer, or if there is an ambiguous informal arrangement with no clear contractual conditions dependency, abuse and harmful working conditions may arise. 30 An estimated 15.5 million children are involved in paid or unpaid domestic work in the home of a third party employer.³¹ Of that an estimated 10.5 million children are considered working in child labour because they are working below the legal minimum working age, are working in hazardous conditions or in circumstances tantamount to slavery.³² It is unknown how many of these children have been "sold" into this situation, but it is known that of child domestic workers, live-in workers are the most exploited.³³

The vulnerability of children in forced child domestic labour went unaddressed for years.³⁴ This was largely because of widely held perceptions that domestic work comprises mainly light duties and therefore could not give cause for concern, as well as the fact that domestic workers were usually hidden away in private households without any regulatory oversight.³⁵ Child

²⁹ Id.

³¹ ILO, "Ending child labour in domestic work and protecting young workers from abusive working conditions" pg. 1 (Geneva, 2013).

³³ Anti-Slavery International, "Home truths; wellbeing and vulnerabilities of child domestic workers" (London 2013).

³⁴ Catherine Turner, "Out of the shadows, Child marriage and slavery", Anti-Slavery International, pg. 30 (London, April 2013). ³⁵ Id.

domestic work has recently been identified as a trafficking issue, ³⁶ however it is also an issue for the sale of children as many children in domestic work are often sold but not necessarily trafficked, and thus may not be covered by trafficking laws, and do to cultural expectations are not considered as being in forced labour either.

Child domestic workers are difficult to detect and protect due to cultural understanding around the practice. Domestic work is often seen as an obligation that children have towards adults (particularly in family settings) and especially for girls, and thus even conditions that in other occupations may be seen as forced labour, are not considered so for domestic workers due to cultural values and expectations.³⁷ Children may be sold because their family is in bonded labour or they may be recruited by intermediaries that can earn a significant share of the child's wages once sold.³⁸ ILO has also noted that children are sometimes "internally trafficked" and thus not covered by nations trafficking laws.³⁹ This is exactly the situation in which laws regarding the sale of children for forced labour could cover this gap that leaves many children unprotected and unable to seek redress from established trafficking laws.

Millions of children, predominantly girls, and most commonly in West Africa, Latin America and many parts of Asia, are sent to work in the homes of relatives or others as domestic workers often for little or no pay. 40 Child domestic work is widely accepted as a positive way to ensure that a young girl is fed and kept safe in return for carrying out household chores.⁴¹ It may also be viewed as part of a girl's preparation for future married life and/or preferable to staying at

³⁶ ILO, "Ending child labour in domestic work and protecting young workers from abusive working conditions" pg. 14 (Geneva, 2013).

³⁷ Id at 1.

³⁸ See Report, supra at note 3, pg. 10.

⁴⁰ Catherine Turner, "Out of the shadows, Child marriage and slavery", Anti-Slavery International, pg. 30 (London, April 2013). ⁴¹ Id.

home if her prospects for marriage are limited.⁴² Indeed, where properly regulated, domestic service can be a perfectly legitimate occupation, including for those under 18 where the legal minimum age for admission to employment is met.⁴³ However, in states that lack proper laws defining child labour and sale of children, trafficking laws can fall short and leave children themselves with little or no options to escape their situation.

In many countries, be it forced or voluntary, child domestic work has remained unrecognized as a form of child labour even though it has been recognized as such by the ILO since 1999. 44 Worldwide only 10% of all domestic workers are covered by general labour legislation, but the situation has been improving in some nations. 5 Since an ILO recommendation about domestic workers in 2011, 6 ten countries have passed new laws or regulations improving domestic workers labour and social rights (Argentina, Bahrain, Brazil, India, the Philippines, Thailand, Spain, Singapore, Venezuela and Vietnam). 7 Reforms have also begun in Austria, Chile, Finland, Jamaica, Kuwait, Morocco, Namibia, Paraguay, the United Arab Emirates, the United States and others. 8 The ILO has worked with these countries to improve labour laws, and it is crucial for the Human Rights Council to also make sure that the revised laws and regulations address the issue of children being sold into domestic work.

i. Case Study: Haiti's Restavek Children

Haiti is an example country that has received much attention for a common form of domestic forced child labour which may involve the sale of the child. In Haiti a *restavek* is a child

⁴² Id.

⁴³ T.J

⁴⁴ ILO, Worst Form of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 (1999).

⁴⁵ ILO, "Ending Child Labour" supra at note 19, pg. 43.

⁴⁶ ILO Domestic Workers Recommendation, No. 201 (2011).

⁴⁷ ILO Ending Child Labour, supra at note 19, pg. 44.

⁴⁸ Id.

that is given or sold to a host family in the hope of a better life in exchange for doing chores.⁴⁹ It is estimated that one in 15 children in Haiti live as restaveks, or 300,000 children, 60% of which are girls. 50 Restavek children are often from rural impoverished homes with little opportunity for education or successful employment.⁵¹ Parents send their child to an urban family to act as parttime maids and cooks in large cities in exchange for sending the child to school or eventually placing them in a good job. 52 Children are often forced to work for multiple hours a day, with no opportunity for school or of ever leaving the home, and with few global or national laws governing this situation the exploitation continues.⁵³ The Council can improve this situation by starting a global discussion to help identify the harm to children and encourage State Parties to pass domestic legislation recognizing restaveks as selling children for forced labour.

B. Servile Marriage

The link between the sale of children for forced labour and child marriage is not always apparent, especially when seen in certain cultural contexts. Child marriage, like domestic labour, however, should be considered the sale of a child for forced labour in certain circumstances. Child marriage may amount to the sale of children for the purpose of forced labour when the marriage agreement includes a transaction in the form of financial payment or in-kind benefits. In such transactions, children are treated as commodities and exchanged for goods or money, or to settle debts or disputes.⁵⁴

The 1930 ILO Convention No. 29 defines forced labour as "all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty for which the said person has not

⁴⁹ Restavek Freedom, Ending Child Slavery in Haiti, https://restavekfreedom.org/issue/, accessed on Feb. 10, 2017.

⁵¹ Id.

⁵⁴ See Report, supra at note 3, pg. 10.

offered himself voluntarily."55 The term "the menace of penalty" has been interpreted to include extreme violence, economic threats, the loss of rights or privileges or even psychological pressure. 56 Forced labour should therefore apply to child marriage whenever it can be established that a child has been exploited by being forced to engage in sexual relations, undertake domestic duties in the home or work outside the home, for the benefit of the spouse or the spouse's family, if they have not voluntary offered to do so and are unable to refuse or to leave the marriage.⁵⁷

Like child domestic workers, child spouses are often sent to live in households away from their familial homes. As children, they are immediately at a disadvantage in being surrounded by people that they may not know and who have considerable power over their wellbeing. Child spouses can be expected to do many household chores and are sometimes live in situations which parallel that of children sold for domestic labour. 58 Child spouses are effectively hidden from view in the marital home and are largely ignored by child protection, welfare and enforcement agencies, as well as policy-makers, just as child domestic workers were for many years. There is now an increasing amount of research on child marriage that confirms this situation is ripe for abuse to turn into forced labour.⁵⁹

Child marriages can result in exploitation, sexual and physical violence and threats, and a life from which these children have little realistic hope of escape. For married children, this situation is compounded in many societies by their marital status, which can render them no longer entitled to the special protections afforded to other children under national law. 60 Child spouses can benefit from additional protections to the global framework protecting children from

⁵⁵ ILO, Forced Labour Convention, C29, 28 June 1930, C29, available at: http://www.refworld.org/docid/3ddb621f2a.html [accessed February 10, 2017].

⁵⁶ Catherine Turner, "Out of the shadows, Child marriage and slavery", Anti-Slavery International, pg. 29 (London, April 2013).

⁵⁷Id. at 29.

⁵⁸ See Catherine Turner, "Child marriage and slavery" at note 40, pg. 30.

⁶⁰ Id.

sale for forced labour. It is time the practice is recognized as a potential hiding place for child labour and slavery-like practices.

C. Agriculture

ILO estimates agriculture to be the largest sector employing working children, with 98 million children or 60% of working children worldwide. This phenomenon is present across the regions and in different forms depending on the country. An ILO study on forced labour in agriculture found that a high proportion of children involved in forced labour had to work to repay debts taken on by their families, had to work until a family debt was paid off or were born into bondage. Forced child labour in agriculture continues due to lack of legal protections in production countries and high demand in high-income purchasing countries, creating an environment ripe for exploitation of children.

ii. Case Study: Ghana's Cocoa Farming Industry

Child labour in Ghana is estimated at 21.8 percent of all children, a rather high number. ⁶⁵ These 21.8% of children work beyond light child labour, which is permissible by law. Their work is considered child labour as it affects the child's health, education, morals and development negatively. ⁶⁶ Many of the children performing child labour in Ghana work in the cocoa industry. During cocoa harvest season, some children are prevented from attending school in order to support harvesting. ⁶⁷ Some of them use dangerous harvesting hooks which can cause sharp cuts to the head, eyes or other parts of the body. ⁶⁸

12

⁶¹ See Report, supra at note 3, pg. 10.

⁶² Id.

⁶³ Id, at 11.

⁶⁴ Id.

⁶⁵ ILO, "Good Practices and Lessons Learned in Cocoa Communities in Ghana" (2015).

⁶⁶ The Children's Act 1998 (Act 560), Ghana's 1992 Constitution, ILO Convention No. 138 on the Minimum Age for Employment and 182 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

⁶⁷ ILO, Good Practices in Ghana, supra at note 65, pg. 2.

⁶⁸ Id.

Ghana has been very proactive in trying to eradicate child labour in their country. They have created many national, district and community level agencies to eliminate child labour, however, the rate of decline had slowed within the past 10 years. ⁶⁹ In 2010, ILO launched a project in Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire to help eliminate child labour. The project was seen as very successful and centered on a few basic ideas to prevent child labour, mainly educating to population to the harms of child labour, and encouraging monitoring of various industries to prevent child labour. ⁷⁰

From this project a few recommendations were made that could be very helpful in trying to eradicate child labour in other nations. First, attempts should be made to try and prevent child labour countrywide, and not focus on specific industries. Second, there should be a focus on setting up monitoring and help lines across every sector. The project recommended that a free hotline be established so that witnesses or victims of child labour could call law enforcement for help. Third, education on the harms of child labour should happen at all levels including the community and local government. Fourth, child labour education should also be incorporated into family planning activities so that families can know about the risks and harms of having their children work when planning their families. In ally, the most important feature of this project was that Ghana had already created several laws regarding child labour and the sale of children.

As a result, law enforcement and local governments were able to enforce violations and have effective monitoring. The Human Rights Council can encourage State Parties to follow Ghana's

. .

⁶⁹ Id. at 1.

⁷⁰ Id.

⁷¹ Id. at 11.

 $^{^{72}}$ Id

⁷³ Id.

⁷⁴ Id. at 79.

⁷⁵ Id.

example by setting clear definitions and guidelines for what is considered sale of children for forced labour and encourage State Parties to pass local legislation.

D. Manufacturing

The sale of children for the purpose of forced labour also occurs in manufacturing. ⁷⁶ The carpet-weaving industry in South Asia is a well-known example. Employers pay very low or no wages forcing workers, including children, to contract debts to survive. These debts force them to remain in forced labour/debt bondage.⁷⁷ Situations have also been identified where the head of a household is offered a loan and the conditions for repaying it force the entire family to work in debt bondage for years.⁷⁸

The garment industry also extensively uses children forced labour amounting to slaverylike practices. 79 Child labour is facilitated by the close relationship between employers and parents who often come from the same village. 80 There are examples where young girls are given three-year contracts in spinning mills only to be paid at the end of the three years, resulting in a situation akin to forced labour or debt bondage.⁸¹

E. Other Industries

Children are also sold into forced labour for begging, mainly in Europe and Central Asia. 82 The European Police Office has seen situations of children being sold by their families or pregnant mothers for 40,000 euros for forced begging. 83 There is also evidence of criminal networks pushing poor families into debt and then claiming the children as a way to pay back the

⁷⁸ Id.

 $^{^{76}}$ See Report, supra at note 3, pg. 11. 77 Id.

⁷⁹ Id.

⁸⁰ Id.

⁸¹ Id.

⁸³ Europol, "Child trafficking for exploitation in forced criminal activities and forced begging," The Hague, October, 2014.

debt. The criminal networks then "rent out" the children for the purposes of forced begging.⁸⁴ Sports and armed conflict are other areas where children are sold into forced labour. 85

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is essential for more work to be done regarding the sale of children for forced labour on a global and national scale. Perpetrators are taking advantage of the gaps and loopholes presented in the current trafficking and labour laws and are using children in industries where little regulation exists.

In order to prevent these crimes from continuing, Human Rights Advocates urges the Human Rights Council to:

- 1. Continue to support the Special Rapporteur to expand awareness into the sale of children for forced labour and what constitutes forced labour;
- 2. Encourage the Special Rapporteur to address the issue of a uniform definition of what encompasses the sale of children and what is considered forced labour for a child;
- 3. Urge UN agencies addressing the issue of sale of children for forced labour to collaborate together to address the problem.

4. Request State Parties to:

- a) Pass laws prohibiting the sale of children for forced labour that may be missed by trafficking, slavery, or labour laws, and make a system to monitor business compliance with the laws;
- b) Create appropriate child-sensitive reporting mechanisms such as 24-hour hotlines;
- c) Highlight products and industries that rely upon child labour to raise awareness to international consumers.

⁸⁴ See Report, supra at note 3, pg. 12.